

**\*\*\*DRAFT – WORK IN PROGRESS – PLEASE DO NOT QUOTE WITHOUT  
PERMISSION\*\*\***

**ASA CONFERENCE ON COSMOPOLITANISM, APRIL 2006, KEELE UNIVERSITY, UK**

***Cosmopolitanism and music session***

**WHO ARE THE COSMOPOLITANS? CULTURAL ENTREPRENEURS AND THE DUAL  
AUDIENCE FOR WORLD MUSIC**

**Barbara Bradby and Bart Put,  
Department of Sociology and Institute for International Integration Studies,  
Trinity College, Dublin  
email:  
bbradby@tcd.ie  
putb@tcd.ie**

This paper results from what might (pompously) be called an ‘epiphanic moment’ (Denzin), not long into the current research project on the social networks created around music by new migrants in Ireland. From an initial focus on the ‘scene’ in Dublin, and the way music was entering a public, urban space, we were looking at concerts and concert promotion of musics ‘other’ than the two mainstreams of popular music in Ireland (i.e. on the one hand, mainstream English language rock and pop, and on the other, Irish traditional music). The boundaries of what we were looking at were slippery and far from clear, but we fairly quickly encountered a dichotomy between the concerts put on by diasporic sub-cultures, largely aimed at their own communities, and those put on for the wider public, more often promoted as ‘world music’.

The moment we both remember (Bart at first-hand in an interview, Barbara through hearing Bart’s excitement on the phone soon afterwards) was when it became clear in the course of interviewing a fairly central promoter of ‘world music’ concerts

in Dublin that he was completely unaware of the up-coming concert by a leading 'world' musician, Koffi Olomidé. This was despite the fact that the concert promoter clearly knew and admired his music, and despite the fact that Dublin is still in some ways, a 'very small place'.

The incident immediately clarified and blurred the dichotomy outlined above. The reason the concert promoter was unaware of Koffi's visit was that it had been organised by a Congolese entrepreneur, who owns a small African food store, operating out of a street in the north inner city. This area is rapidly changing, - there is a large new Social Housing complex opposite the shop, and rapid, private 'redevelopment' of adjoining blocks is currently under way - but is still known as one of high street-crime and drug problems, not the sort of place that an ordinary middle-class *flâneur* would stroll down. The shop windows were plastered with posters for Koffi's concert, - they still are, two months later - and tickets were only available from there. Promotion locally was through word of mouth, and through posters in the African shops in Dublin and all throughout the city centre. In practice, as we discovered, this meant that the concert was predominantly attended by people from Congo and other African countries resident in Dublin (we talked to people from Tanzania and from South Africa).

So here was a musician being promoted as a star of 'African music', playing to a diasporic African audience. But he was also a 'world' musician, one who might just as well have come through a circuit of organisation and promotion of 'world music'. The incident revealed the lack of overlap between the networks of contacts set up by the diasporic Congolese, compared with those maintained by a well-versed 'world music' promoter, and likewise the social gap between the middle-class Irish and 'cosmopolitan' audience for 'world music', which was simply absent from the concert, and the diasporic audience, linked in some tenuous way by the music to a 'homeland', in an event that was invisible to the mainstream of Irish society.

However, it also revealed the fatuousness of trying to limit the diasporic community to some sort of inferior 'trans-national' category, contrasting with the heights of 'cosmopolitanism' (see Werbner, 1999). Here in practice, were Africans in Dublin creating networks on a global scale and operating with one of the highest symbols of 'world' music for their own ends. The ritual gift-giving from audience to star traversed the global space between Ireland and the Congo, between Europe and

Africa, doing far more than creating simply a ‘home from home’. There was a palpable sense of ‘cosmopolitanism from below’.

Still, the really striking part of this incident for us was not what the African community were doing in Dublin, but the lack of awareness of the world music community about this event, one which they might have been expected to flock to, and which might have received a lot of exposure in the mainstream media if promoted by the concert promoter in question. The lack of overlap between the networks, only bridged by chance by our own research, was in itself remarkable, but requires further analysis. Both the owner of Daya Shop and the world music promoter are in everyday terms, entrepreneurs, but in the ‘grid-group’ terminology developed by Mary Douglas and her followers, the former operates within a fairly strongly bounded group, while the latter has apparently, no particular group allegiance – as a commercial operator, he seeks the widest audience possible (Douglas 1978, 2005). What is more, the concert given by Koffi Olomidé performs ‘traditional’ hierarchies in a pronounced and obvious way. His arrival is anticipated with crescendoes of pomp, he is proclaimed as the ‘king’ of African music, and onstage, he is the clear chief of the other male bandsmen, and lords it over the female singers. This contrasts with the more egalitarian relationship between a diva of ‘world music’ such as the Mozambiquan-born Mariza, who also played in Dublin this year, but under the aegis of Improvised Music Company, the company of the promoter in question.

In terms of the ‘cultural bias’ of the two networks invoked, it could seem that the African promoter is promoting particularistic music in a particularistic setting, while the world music promoter puts on music in a universalistic spirit – the ability of music to cross cultures is notorious, and as such it has received inordinate interest from theorists of globalisation and cosmopolitanism (e.g. Holton, 2000, Inglis and Robertson, 2005). In practice, the small extent of the market or audience for world music in a city like Dublin, may mean that the world music community is *as*, if not *more*, bounded than is the diasporic African community. Entrepreneurs in a small market must either compete or cooperate, or they may ally with more hierarchical cultures and seek state funding and support. Such alliances, with the combination of political, cultural, and commercial motives involved, tend to lead to conflict and factionalism, and this is one aspect of the history of world music promotion in Dublin that we intend to explore.

Looked at from this point of view, there is more in common between the activities and networks of the two promoters, and the audiences to whom they relate. Both are on the end of global 'chains' of suppliers (to echo the words of the world music promoter), and both are operating in transnational markets. However, both are in a sense operating in niche markets locally, with rather distinct aims and functions for their events.

What this event helped to clarify in our thinking was the sense that for many events of an inter-cultural, sub-cultural, or 'world' nature, there are always two potential audiences, and there are different ways in which different promoters approach the two constituencies. In what follows, we describe two sets of these events, one from a study of the musical activities of migrants from the new EU Accession States, the former 'eastern Europe', and the other from our observation of some 'world music' concerts in Dublin over the last six months. We then consider an analysis in terms of Gerd Baumann's theory of 'ritual constituencies' and end with some comments on the implications of this ongoing work for theories of 'cosmopolitanism'.

### **Poles apart? musical activities of the Polish community in Dublin**

We apologise for the pun. In many ways the new Polish community in Ireland has been exemplary in its integration and successful adoption of Ireland as a second home. Already the story of the 'eastern European' migration into Ireland is attracting attention, with the Economic and Social Research Institute confidently stating that Ireland has the highest percentage of migrants from the new Accession States per head of population of all the EU countries (interview broadcast as part of Ed Sturton programme on the European Union, March 2006). The economists are happily laying this at the door of Ireland's 'flexible labour market', with the recent dispute at Irish Ferries illustrating the tensions and limits of such a model. Certainly Ireland's reputation for consumerist prosperity, and the wages gap between Irish levels and those in the new Accession States must be a large factor. But it is interesting that already stereotypes have developed about the new migrants, the Poles as hard workers, the Lithuanians for crime, and the Latvians for drink-driving – stereotypes that have also been combatted and deconstructed in public media discussion, but

which nevertheless do point to differences in the ways that the different nationalities are integrating into the Irish economy, with the Poles being the big success story.

It is not clear yet whether cultural factors have influenced migration decisions, particularly Ireland's status as a Roman Catholic country still, with the peculiar relationship set up in 1979 by the visit of the Polish pope to Ireland, continued through the years of Solidarnos by a 'special relationship' treatment of Polish events in the Irish media; also perhaps Ireland's reputation as a fun-loving, heavy-drinking country.<sup>1</sup> Certainly the predominantly youthful nature of Polish immigration corresponds to Ireland's promotion of its young, educated population to international investors over the last 30 years, and culturally, to its role as an exporter of rock and popular music, alongside the export of the 'Irish pub' as a youth-oriented global counter-cultural form (Brian Torode, personal communication). (And here we are reminded of the former Pope's much quoted soundbite: 'Young people of Ireland, I love you.')

However, alongside this apparently successful economic integration, and paradoxically a sign of it, has gone an extraordinary growth of Polish-language media in Ireland over the last couple of years: a whole range of newspapers like *Polska Gazeta*, *Polish Express*, *Polski Herald* (the weekly Polish supplement in Dublin's *Evening Herald*), also a number of websites specifically dedicated to Poles living in Ireland like *Dublinek.net* (operated from London), *PolskiDublin.com*, and *gazeta.ie*, as well as a recently launched Polish TV news broadcasting (*Oto Polska*) on Dublin's City Channel. Activities in the musical sphere are part of this. In December 2004, the visual 'scene' created by street posters advertising concerts etc. was confidently disrupted by a Polish-language one advertising a Christmas 'Polska Noc', immediately making visible the monocultural English-language character of this 'scene' in a way that had not been evident before.

This poster pointed up the fact that many of the new migrants have little or no English when they arrive, and many of them experience downward social mobility in occupational terms as a result.<sup>2</sup> Communication in Polish was probably a functional necessity in this sense to bring the community together; nevertheless, it altered the

---

<sup>1</sup> An *Irish Times* piece on Polish pubs in Dublin is headlined, 'Irish emigrants sang rebel songs, Polish immigrants have karaoke sessions. We drank too much. They might too - ...' (O'Dwyer 2006)

<sup>2</sup> The same *Irish Times* piece quotes several examples of downward mobility: 'In Poland I'm a photographer. Here I'm a cleaner.' 'I worked as a hairdresser in Poland. I'd like to do it again here,

streetscape of Dublin irrevocably, proclaiming a de facto multiculturalism in a way that no civic-sponsored festival could.<sup>3</sup> Since we started the project last October (2005) we have been following Polish musical events systematically and interviewing promoters. Because of our language limitations, participation at concerts and discos has been mainly limited to observation, while much of our more detailed information comes from interviewing promoters and intermediaries through the medium of English.

What is emerging from this work is an initial clear distinction between those intermediaries interested in promoting 'home-from-home' or 'trans-national' events and those who want to foster intercultural dialogue between the Polish and the Irish, so conforming more to the idea of cosmopolitanism as 'empathy for the other'. Lukasz, for instance, who has recently set up his own promotion agency, is mainly involved in the organisation of large-scale Polish club nights, bringing over and featuring the resident DJs of one of the most popular clubs in Poland (Club Ekwador in Manieczki). His events are often scheduled on festive dates of the Polish calendar, including older ones like St. Catherine's day, or St. Andrew's day, and newer ones like the Great Orchestra of Christmas Charity. They are advertised chiefly through Polish-language print and electronic media.

Lukasz sees his work first and foremost as a 'service to the Polish community in Ireland' – interestingly, he used the word 'community' consistently throughout the interview. He explains his current activities through a personal narrative of intense loneliness and cultural isolation as a new migrant in Ireland:

When I first came to Ireland four years ago, I couldn't even find the Polish church. (...) It was very difficult for me, you know, far away from my family to stay over here without friends, without anything. (...) So the main reason for this one is to bring over here to Ireland a piece of Poland.

---

but my English isn't good.' 'I do security in Zagloba [Polish bar] only on the weekends. I work in a factory too. I worked in a bank in Poland as a financial analyst.' (O'Dwyer 2006, p.15)

<sup>3</sup> Not all Poles approved of this Polish activity. A Polish friend when questioned was scornful of all that this 'Polish night' represented, displaying typical first-wave migrant resentment of the second-wave, who according to him, were involved in crime and spoiling the situation for those hard workers like him who had originally set up the connection with Ireland.

His primary discourse is therefore the almost maternal one of providing familiar sights and sounds of home for those away from their families and suffering from home-sickness.

At the events organised by Lukasz, the space is set up as entirely 'Polish'. The Polish flag is extensively used as decoration, alongside advertising from sponsoring Polish companies in Ireland. The predominant colours in the advertising logos are red and white (at the entrance, on the walls inside the club, on T-shirts people wore, on fliers and newspapers distributed in the club). The beer is Polish, and a buffet with Polish snacks is generally sponsored by one of Dublin's local Polish bars. Interaction between DJs and crowd is facilitated by the adaptation of the space to place the DJs on a stage facing the crowd instead of in a closed-off booth, high up and removed from the proceedings on the floor.

At all of Lukasz's events that we attended, the DJs and the club promoter addressed the crowd exclusively in Polish. On each occasion, the DJs would address and involve the crowd through calling out the names of Polish cities in turn so invoking regional allegiances. This was then superseded by the DJ starting to chant 'Polska, Polska' on the beat of the music, with the crowd on the dance-floor quickly joining in. This happened several times, at a number of different events, so acquiring a ritual flavour. There was a sense of 'collective effervescence' (Durkheim), as regionalism and other social hierarchies operating in everyday life were temporarily suspended in order to demonstrate belonging to a higher, 'overarching' social category, such as 'community', or 'Polishness'.

Contrasting strongly with Lukasz and his events are the activities and ethos espoused by Ewa, another prominent promoter of Polish musical events in Dublin. Ewa works for a non-governmental organisation set up to help newly arriving Poles in Ireland with information on accommodation, sources of income, health services, language courses, etc. The NGO has a 'grass roots' feel, but is commercially funded, with the main sponsors being Western Union (US multi-national money transfer company) and VHI Healthcare (Ireland's major indigenous healthcare insurance provider). Ewa emphasised again and again in interview how important it was to organise events that are not targeted only at Poles. For her it was clear that Polish immigrants could be best helped in the musical sphere by on the one hand, creating opportunities to acquaint the wider Irish audience with Polish music, and on the other,

offering a locus of meaningful intercultural contact and exchange between Polish and non-Polish people in Ireland.

Ewa herself distinguishes between what we have called ‘home-from-home’ or trans-national activities, and more intercultural aims:

It’s definitely more to promote Polish stuff here in Dublin, in Ireland. Especially that considering this thing that there’s so many nations here. Not just Irish, not just Polish people, also other nations, so it’s really important. (...) Not Poland in Ireland. Just you know to promote it, so it’s definitely the most important thing for me, alright? (...) So I’m not going to do Poland in Ireland, I’m going to promote Polish good things in Ireland. (...) To promote it and to integrate it.

Here she clearly distances herself from the ‘trans-national’ aim of ‘Poland in Ireland’, and allies with the more cosmopolitan objective of promoting and integrating good Polish culture in Ireland. She thought about potential live acts very consciously in the light of these objectives. The concert of the band Sistars, for example, had been particularly successful in her eyes, because ‘they sing in English as well’, and ‘that kind of music [a mixture of rock, hip-hop, and R&B] is popular as well in the entire world (...) not just for Poles’. One of the events she was working on at the time of the interview was a ‘Polish-Irish weekend’, with several concerts by both Polish and Irish bands, and a photo exhibition showing pictures of Poland’s wildlife. The total package carried the title ‘From Polish to Irish music: through our culture’, which, she told me, was ‘her kind of title’, expressing the general philosophy behind her activities. Similarly, posters and leaflets were issued in both English and Polish versions (not a mixture), so that everyone could understand everything, and concerts were advertised in Polish pubs, shops and media as well as in Irish media. This ethos of intercultural dialogue was also apparent in her attempts to secure Polish representation at festivals like Clonmel Junction, the Dublin Fringe (theatre festival) - both arts festivals with a distinctly ‘international’ character -, and the St. Patrick’s Day Parade.<sup>4</sup>

In line with these promotional strategies, presentation at events that Ewa organises is bilingual, and the iconography and symbolism is much less ‘Polish’ than that described above at Lukasz’s events. At the concert for the popular singer, Monika Brodka, for instance, the director of the organisation introduced the event,

---

<sup>4</sup> See Basegmez (2005) on transformations in the representational regime of the St. Patrick’s Day Parade in Dublin, and particularly on its increasing concern with representing Ireland as an inclusive and multicultural nation.

first in English, then in Polish, the translation mirroring the dual printing of the promotional fliers and posters. This attempted framing was not entirely successful, and met with what could be understood as ‘resistance’ from the musicians. Monika Brodka addressed the audience in Polish throughout, and was challenged by one of the very few Irish people in the audience, who shouted out, ‘In English please!’ Towards the end of the concert, she apologised to the audience – this time in English – for speaking in Polish, excusing herself on grounds that her English was not good enough and she was still learning it. This act brought her self-presentation back into line with the intercultural ‘framing’ by the promoters (just...). However, another act by a musician overtly encouraged complicit resistance on the part of the audience to the intercultural framing. Just before the band left the stage before coming back for encores, the keyboard player picked out the first notes of the Polish national anthem while smiling at the audience.

So far we have used the two case studies to illustrate the difference between trans-national cultures and intercultural ones, and seeing these characteristics as located in the persons of the two promoters. However, we will hardly surprise you if we tell you that things were not as simple as this, and that as we approximate a more complex picture of these people’s activities, we have to step back from the simple idea that people are or are not transnationals, locals, cosmopolitans. Instead, we see ways in which they step in and out of various discourses or cultures, using them, rather than simply being used or interpellated by them as subjects.

To go back to Lukasz: we remarked earlier on his persistent appeals to ‘community’ and his almost maternal discourse of creating a home-like environment for the young, lost migrant. At the same time, Lukasz was an entrepreneur, and was not averse to seeing this ‘community’ as ‘the new market’, full of lurking opportunities for profitable business. This second, commercial discourse leads him easily into pursuing the larger audience that is potentially there for his events in the wider Irish society. Despite the primary orientation of his work to the Polish community/market, then, he also made clear moves to attract a non-Polish audience. This was through a variety of means: on-air advertisements on one of Dublin’s commercial, chart radio stations, printing posters and fliers in a mixture of English and Polish, and organising pre-party street events in Dublin city centre.

It turned out that Ewa, too, had another side to her story, and was not consistent in her espousal of the intercultural ethos. Later during the interview, after

having stressed several times the importance of ‘not doing Poland in Ireland’, she admitted (with visible embarrassment) that there were exceptions to this general rule. In discussing her plans to bring over Polish rock band KULT, she said: ‘This is like really for Poles. (...) They love this band really.’ The initial aim was to let them play not only in Dublin, but also in Cork and Limerick, ‘because there’s so many Polish people living there as well (...) I would like to do something for them as well’<sup>5</sup>. This subtle change in discourse (from ‘intercultural dialogue’ to ‘servicing the community’) was matched by a remarkable change in the layout of the posters: the two versions were replaced by one version printed in a mixture of Polish and English (with the practical information in Polish), the background colours were red and white, and the name and logo of the organization had vanished. Moreover, the Irish-owned venue which staged these concerts had also made some clear efforts to define these events as ‘Polish’ ones. In the listings of the venue on a poster in its corridor, we noticed that only the Polish bands were further qualified in terms of their country of origin (‘from Poland’) while the rest of the listed bands were not. Also, on the venue website (which is entirely in English), the KULT concerts were announced in Polish (only after opening a hyperlink would the English version appear).

At the Kult concerts (they played on two consecutive nights in Dublin – both sold out!), there were none of the ambiguous shifts between English and Polish, and none of the contestations and resistances heard at the Monika Brodka concert. This was quite simply because everyone, including quite a significant Irish contingent in the audience, understood that this was going to be a ‘Polish’ concert by a ‘Polish’ band. Nobody took offence when Kazik (the highly charismatic band leader) talked to the audience exclusively in Polish, and there was no possibility of the kind of ‘English please!’ interjection heard at the other event. At the same time, the representation of Poland within the meanings of the songs played is much more subtle than the simple chanting of ‘Polska’ by the Polish DJs and dance audience. One of Kult’s most well-known songs, which dates from 1987 and the Jaruzelski period is a bleak invocation of the depressing nature of Poland and life in Poland.

---

<sup>5</sup> It is easy to see why a band like KULT is *claimed* as Polish in a way that Sistars is not. They gained enormous popularity among Polish youth during the last years of the communist regime, not least because a lot of the lyrics (mostly in Polish) contained ‘hidden’ subversive messages commenting on political issues. Today still, many Poles see them as a cultural icon of the revolutionary generation (see Kan & Hayes, 1994; Kotarba, 2002).

Morning glare, morning glare,  
 When I walk on the sea-shore in Sopot,  
 On the beach sandy-dirty  
 Baltic stinks with oil.  
 Morning pavements,  
 When I'm walking I'm not talking  
 To anyone  
 On how it is on the Sunday morning –  
 After Saturday parties – the pavements dirty with puke.

Poland,  
 I live in Poland,  
 I live in Poland,  
 I live here, here, here, here, here!

Afternoon concerts,  
 Security forces are full of morons,  
 They look around, because their hands  
 are itchy –  
 They love to beat more and more.  
 Evening adventures again,  
 When I climb the stone stairs  
 I'm being harassed by so many  
 Drunk punks.

Poland,  
 I live in Poland,  
 I live in Poland,  
 I live here, here, here, here, here!

The night shops with milk,  
 And I look – what's going on in front of the shop?  
 The crowd puts its fists to someone's face,  
 They demand death penalty for him.  
 Morning trains again.  
 I'm standing and looking at weirdos in uniforms.  
 Have you ever been at the Kutno rail station at night?  
 It's so dirty and ugly that my eyes are bursting.

Poland,  
 I live in Poland,  
 I live in Poland,  
 I live here, here, here, here, here!<sup>6</sup>

At the moment, we can only speculate as to the meanings that this acquires when played to mainly economic migrants in Ireland. But it is certainly not uncommon to hear Poles in Ireland talk quite negatively of Poland, no doubt with economic considerations uppermost, implying a dialectic of rejection by and of their home country and a resentful determination never to return. Just how these kind of feelings interact with the desire to go and hear Poland's most well-known punk band remains to be investigated.

In short, although Lukasz and Ewa might at first sight resemble the “ideal-types” of transnationalist and cosmopolitan respectively, it is clear that such a

---

<sup>6</sup> We wish to express our personal gratitude to Ewa Komorek, a colleague in the IIS, who made this translation of the Kult lyrics for us, and has helped in numerous other ways in our research with the Polish community in Dublin.

distinction cannot be upheld that easily. Both promoters switch discourses at times, just as concert performers and audiences can subvert the organisers' intentions, and bring about switches in definitions of outsider and insider. We return to this argument below.

### **World music concerts: trans-national interruptions**

Our attempt at a clear distinction between a 'trans-national' sphere of diasporic musical activities and a 'cosmopolitan' sphere of world music, breaks down again when we look at world music concerts. In brief, the more cosmopolitan a city becomes, in the sense of having in-coming migrants from many parts of the world, the more likely it is that a concert marketed as 'world music' will attract a dual audience, composed not just of the middle-class audience for world music, but also of members of the diasporic community of the country of origin of the visiting artist or band. The artist may then have to perform some sort of balancing act in appealing to the two constituencies, and the constituencies themselves may enter into the performance in ways that involve a dialogue, not just with the artist on stage, but also with the other part of the audience.

The most striking exemplar of this process was at the Rachid Taha event last November (2005). Taha has a reputation for fairly dissolute living, and despite the stories of visa problems, it was no great surprise when his first date was cancelled at the beginning of November. However, the event was successfully mounted at the end of that month, and the Vicar Street venue was full. From our slightly tiered seats at the back of the hall, we could see people dancing among the table-seating, both quite a large contingent of apparently North African people nearer the stage, and a group of apparently Irish people doing a plausible approximation of 'belly dancing' towards the back of the hall and nearer to where we were sitting. We surmised that they were people who had either lived or holidayed in North Africa, and they made their knowledge of and enthusiasm for the music and dancing very evident.

The music was a mixture of loud, hybrid rock-rai pieces, with interludes of softer pieces played on traditional stringed and percussion instruments. The language of the songs, as I perceived it, was mainly Arabic and French, with Taha addressing the crowd incoherently, mainly in French, but with some broken English. As the crescendo built towards the end of the night, (which there were no prizes for guessing

was going to be ‘Rock the Kasbah’), a group of the North African dancers invaded the stage, waving the Algerian flag and singing along in Arabic. There was some attempt to remove them from the stage, but two women remained on, dancing for the star in what in innocent, Catholic Ireland we would call ‘belly dancing’ style, stunning to watch, and adding greatly to the sense of excitement and crescendo on stage.

*Here we are reminded that places, too, can be described as cosmopolitan. It is difficult to describe what it feels like to be sitting in the heart of old Dublin – Vicar Street is a stone’s throw from Guinness’ brewery, but also from a pub like the Brazen Head or one-time folk venue the Tailors’ Hall.- and to see the Algerian flag and hear people singing in Arabic. It is a tremendously exhilarating moment – after what seems like the long darkness of monoculturalism and introspection in Ireland, but also one pregnant with incongruities, which it seems important to hold on to. The day before the concert took place there was a news item of the sentencing of the man billed as ‘the first al-Qaeda member to go on trial in the UK’, as it happened, in Belfast.*

To return to the Rachid Taha concert, the majority audience was white, middle-class, Irish and other Europeans who have a taste for hybrid music of this and many other kinds, and who perhaps habitually go to the kinds of events put on by Note Productions. The minority, but vocal and visible audience, was a diasporic one, probably mainly Algerian, but presumably including other Arabic speakers resident in Dublin. The event was an occasion where that diaspora made its presence felt, including the obvious national symbol of the flag, but also through the use of Arabic and the bodily displays of dancing, so that there was a sense in which a dialogue took place between the two major segments of the audience. In Gerd Baumann’s terms, there was a play with and shifting of the boundary between insider and outsider between the two ‘ritual constituencies’ (1992). While the world music audience might have felt at home, as regular gig-goers at this venue and at events organised by these promoters, they were rapidly positioned as outsiders to the exchanges of Algerian symbols and Arabic language which grew in intensity to quite literally take over the space towards the end of the gig.

The irony of this kind of shift is that it is those positioned theoretically as ‘cosmopolitans’ because of their ‘willingness to engage with the Other’, who actually understand *least* about what is actually going on. Here the issue of language again becomes important, as it was in the discussion of Polish cultural events. Since

observing the Taha event, we have started to notice more explicitly the switches in language-use at world music events. In three very different concerts observed – the Portuguese fado-singer, Mariza, world music stars Amadou and Mariam from Mali, and a Swedish folk group called Frifot – different ‘ritual constituencies’ were constituted through the languages used to communicate with the audience by the artists.

Mariza introduced her songs and addressed the audience in English for most of her show, with the usual mixture of banter and explanation of the music, how she had learnt it, what the songs were about, etc. Audiences in Ireland, are, at any rate we like to think, much noisier and more interactive than audiences in the UK or elsewhere. It is very much part of the concert experience to call out for songs, showing one’s appreciative knowledge of the artist’s recorded repertoire and assuring them that they have a fan-base in Ireland. There is also a strong tradition of humorous heckling (cf. Duffett 2004). On this occasion, we were aware of people calling out in Portuguese for songs being called out towards the end of Mariza’s set. And then, at one point, she herself clearly addressed the Portuguese present, excusing herself first in English, with words to the effect that ‘Now I’m going to sing one for my Portuguese friends present’. It was a moment of intimacy and validation for the Portuguese-speakers present. As non-Portuguese speakers we were then positioned as spectators to this episode, even though we could partake in the emotion and the excitement of the creation of this little piece of ‘home’. Once again, the switch had taken place, and the positions of the two ‘ritual constituencies’ were being gently nudged in relation to each other through the triple dialogue taking place.

On both these occasions, the major ‘other’ languages being used have claims to being world ones, French, Portuguese, and Arabic. Hence the irony of the ‘world’ audience being excluded from the moments of diasporic intimacy, or the interruption of the cosmopolitan space by the ‘trans-national’ community. Cosmopolitanism is, in practice, severely limited by inadequate multilingualism. In the economic sphere, rapidly shifting growth centres may mean that the days of ethnocentric cosmopolitanism based on the old imperial languages – now being whittled down to a monolingual English global culture – may yet be reversed. In cultural matters, language becomes even more symbolic of difference and of home.

Swedish, by contrast, has no pretensions to being a world language. Yet, at a concert by the folk group Frifot, there was also a moment of Swedish-language

intimacy. This was in a very different, small pub venue, with a crowd of only around 50 people. Language issues were fairly uppermost in the introductions given to sung pierces, since clearly we, the non-Swedish speakers in the audience, didn't understand what they were about. Leana, the singer, gives us a potted summary in English of the lyrics of some of them, which helped. But at one point she did address a remark to the audience in Swedish, and there was a quick interchange with members of the audience; then she said, in English, ‘

The Swedish ambassador will translate everything afterwards, outside the pub (.) or inside the pub. [[jokingly amid laughter.]].

Only at this point did it become clear that there were several Swedish people in the small audience, at the same time making evident the Swedish government support for the tour, which is part of a cultural interchange called Facing North. The Swedish ambassador, his wife, and other Swedish people present mingled and chatted to the crowd, some of whom were buying CDs from members of the group, after the event.

Finally, at the concert by Amadou and Mariam, like that of Rachid Taha, there were again three languages in use: some rather halting introductions in English by Amadou himself, who particularly towards the end of the concert, tended more towards communication in a heavily accented French. (‘Maintenant, nous allons chanter tous ensemble!’) But many songs were also in an indigenous Malian language. This was an event in a big theatre venue, with a fairly mixed-looking audience. Once again, one was conscious of the two audiences, but also of the blurring between them: there was the white middle-class, not-so-young audience, (we heard English as well as Irish accents around where we were sitting), alongside people who looked like African immigrants but were equally middle-class looking and may well have been ‘world music’ connoisseurs. Once again, one could feel the ‘otherness’ of French being spoken in Dublin as a public means of communication, particularly an African-inflected French which invoked the whole history of French colonialism and the post-colonial importance of Paris as one of the centres or propagators of what became ‘world music’. Seated high up in the theatre, and missing some of the French introductions to, and words of songs, we could certainly feel less than cosmopolitan in relation to the diaspora audience present, who created some sense of transnationalism, even at this concert by 2006 icons of world music.

## Conclusion

In recent discussions about globalisation and cosmopolitanism in sociology, anthropology and political theory, some scholars have been eager to draw examples from the field of music to illustrate certain points of their argument (e.g. Holton, 2000, Inglis and Robertson, 2005). However, because the notion of cosmopolitanism is somewhat of a ‘floating signifier’ (Vertovec & Cohen, 2002), it should come as no surprise that the exact way in which this relationship has been conceptualised differs drastically from author to author. Ulrich Beck (2004) for instance sees our daily encounter with musics from all over the world (and musical cross-fertilization in particular) as evidence of what he calls ‘banal cosmopolitanism’, or the increasing rate and speed at which people’s local lifeworlds are being penetrated by cultural flows originating from elsewhere. Similarly, Vertovec & Cohen (2002: 4) speak of world music as symptomatic of a growing sense of ‘global identification’ or ‘global consciousness’. By contrast, those who conceive of cosmopolitanism as a more active mode of ‘engaging with the other’ (Hannerz, 1996) sometimes consider world music as an ideal medium to help ‘subside cultural tensions’, ‘resolve conflicts’, and help establish a cosmopolitan ‘planetary identity’ (Leymarie quoted in Inglis & Robertson, 2005: 169)<sup>7</sup>. Still others have sought to critique this idea of music as an instrument of progressive cosmopolitan politics by precisely emphasizing the way in which this ‘cosmopolitan appeal’ is played out as a marketing strategy by music industry actors (Haynes, 2005), or by pointing to the class-based (and hence exclusionary) nature of a ‘cosmopolitan’ musical taste (Bryson, 1996).

Despite the differences between these various contributions, there exists an implicit consensus among researchers as to what kinds of music should (and should not) be referred to when coining the notion of cosmopolitanism (as if “cosmopolitan” were a designated quality of some musical objects and not others). As a result, the musical activities of migrant communities for instance have largely been absent from the debate, presumably because they are more often associated with ‘boundary

---

<sup>7</sup> Such a view of music as a vehicle for cosmopolitanism (in the Kantian sense of the word) not only pervades much of the everyday and policy discourse surrounding world music (as exemplified by UNESCO), it is indeed firmly rooted in various strands of academic thinking on music. Nearly twenty years ago, ethnomusicologist John Blacking expressed the belief that acquainting oneself with different forms of musical expression would eventually make the individual ‘feel beyond the cultural trappings of the different worlds of music to the common humanity which inspired the music’ (2004 [1987]: 30). Similarly, according to George Lipsitz, ‘the inter-cultural communication’ encoded in particular types of music offered a certain ‘hope for a better future’ (1994: 14).

making' than 'boundary breaking'. Indeed, when dealing with music in *this* context, theoretical vocabularies tend to shift towards notions of '(imagined) community' (Lornell & Rasmussen, 1997) and 'alternative spaces' (Gross et al., 2002). Here music becomes a primary means 'by which the 'cultural baggage' of 'home' can be transported through time and space' (Connell & Gibson, 2003: 61), a crucial element in the expression and constitution of 'the diasporic experience' (ibid.), and so on.

While cosmopolitanism and transnationalism have thus been dealt with more or less separately in the literature on music, we argue on the basis of our ongoing research in Dublin, that both world music events and the musical activities of immigrant communities seem to be much more complexly structured in terms of this distinction. In order to get a firm empirical grasp of this complexity, it is important to get an insight into how promoters define the musics they circulate and how they approach their potential audiences, how musicians operate within this (always incomplete) framework, and how heterogeneous audiences (or different 'ritual constituencies', to use Baumann's words once again) actively appropriate and thereby help shape the meaning(s) of a musical performance. In short: how music is caught up in all these different kinds of what Lamont & Aksartova have called 'symbolic boundary work' (2002; see also Lamont & Molnar, 2002; for music see especially Stokes, 1994) carried out by various social actors, the distinctions they draw on in discourse and practice when investing music with particular meanings.

## References

- Basegmez, V. (2005). *Irish Scene and Sound: Identity, Authenticity and Transnationality among Young Musicians*. Stockholm: Elanders Gotab.
- Baumann, G. (1992). Ritual implicates 'Others': Rereading Durkheim in a plural society. In D. de Coppet (Ed.), *Understanding Rituals* (97-116). London: Routledge.
- Beck, U. (2004). Cosmopolitical realism: on the distinction between cosmopolitanism in philosophy and the social sciences, *Global Networks*, 4(2): 131-156.

- Blacking, J. (2004 [1987]). 'Let all the world hear all the world's music': popular music-making and music education. In S. Frith (Ed.), *Popular Music: Critical Concepts in Media and Cultural Studies, Vol. IV, Music and Identity* (7-31). London: Routledge.
- Brusila, J. (2003). *Local Music, not from here. The Discourse of World Music examined through three Zimbabwean case studies: the Bhundu Boys, Virginia Mukwesha and Sunduza*. Helsinki: Finnish Society for Ethnomusicology.
- Bryson, B. (1996). "Anything but heavy metal": symbolic exclusion and musical dislikes, *American Sociological Review*, 61(5): 884-899.
- Connell, J. & Gibson, C. (2003). *Sound Tracks. Popular Music, Identity, and Place*. London: Routledge.
- Cunningham, S. (2001). Popular media as public 'sphericules' for diasporic communities, *International Journal of Cultural Studies*, 4(2): 131-147.
- DeNora, T. (2000). *Music in Everyday Life*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Douglas, M. (1978) *Cultural Bias*. London: Royal Anthropological Institute
- Douglas, M. (2005) 'Grid and Group: New Developments', Workshop on Complexity and Cultural Theory, in honour of Michael Thompson, London School of Economics, 27 June, pp. 1-16, available on line at <http://www.psych.lse.ac.uk/complexity/Workshops/MaryDouglas.pdf> last accessed 9/4/06
- Erlmann, V. (2003). Hybridity and globalization (intercultural exchange, acculturation), *Continuum Encyclopedia of Popular Music of the World*, Vol. 1 (241-246).
- Frith, S. (2000). The Discourse of World Music. In G. Born & D. Hesmondhalgh (Eds.), *Western Music and its Others* (305-322). Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Gross, J., McMurray, D. & Swedenburg, T. (2002). Arab Noise and Ramadan Nights: Rai, Rap, and Franco-Maghrebi Identities. In J. Inda & R. Rosaldo (Eds.), *The Anthropology of Globalization. A Reader* (198-230). Oxford: Blackwell.
- Guilbault, J. (2001). World music. In S. Frith, W. Straw & J. Street (Eds.), *The Cambridge Companion to Pop and Rock* (176-192). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Hannerz, U. (1996). *Transnational Connections: Culture, People, Places*. London: Routledge.

- Haynes, J. (2005). World music and the search for difference, *Ethnicities*, 5(3): 365-385.
- Holton, R. (2000). Globalization's cultural consequences, *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 570(1): 140-152.
- Inglis, D. & Robertson, R. (2005). 'World music' and the globalization of sound. In D. Inglis & J. Hughson (Eds.), *The Sociology of Art: Ways of Seeing* (156-170). Basingstoke: Palgrave.
- Kan, A. & Hayes, N. (1994). Big Beat in Poland. In S.P. Ramet (Ed.), *Rocking the State: Rock Music and Politics in Eastern Europe and Russia* (41-53). Boulder: Westview.
- Kotarba, J.A. (2002). Popular music and teenagers in post-communist Poland. In Denzin, N. (Ed.), *Studies in Symbolic Interaction*, Vol. 25 (233-246). Oxford: Elsevier Science.
- Lamont, M. & Aksartova, S. (2002). Ordinary Cosmopolitanisms: Strategies for Bridging Racial Boundaries among Working-Class Men, *Theory, Culture & Society*, 19(4): 1-25.
- Lamont, M. & Molnár, V. (2002). The study of boundaries in the social sciences, *Annual Review of Sociology*, 28: 167-195.
- Lipsitz, G. (1994). *Dangerous Crossroads: Popular music, Postmodernism and the Poetics of Place*. London: Verso.
- Lornell, K. & Rasmussen, A.K. (Eds.) (1997). *Musics of Multicultural America: a Study of Twelve Musical Communities*. Belmont (Cal.): Schirmer.
- Negus, K. (1999). *Music Genres and Corporate Cultures*. London: Routledge.
- O'Dwyer, D. (2006) 'Having the Cracow', *Irish Times Weekend Section*, March 18, pp. 15-18
- Regelski, T. (2004). Social theory, and music and music education as praxis, *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education*, 3(3).  
[<http://mas.siue.edu/ACT/v3/Regelski04.pdf>]
- Sennet, R. (2002). Cosmopolitanism and the Social Experience of Cities. In S. Vertovec & R. Cohen (Eds.), *Conceiving Cosmopolitanism: Theory, Context and Practice* (42- 47). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Stapleton, C. (1989). Paris, Africa. In F. Hanly & T. May (Eds.), *Rhythms of the World* (10-23). London: BBC Books.

- Stokes, M. (1994). Introduction: Ethnicity, Identity and Music. In M. Stokes (Ed.), *Ethnicity, Identity and Music: the Musical Construction of Place* (1-27). Oxford: Berg.
- Turner, V. (1987). *The Anthropology of Performance*. New York: PAJ.
- UNESCO Culture Newsletter (30/09/2004). [[www.unesco.org/culture/newsletter-en/sept/newsen.htm](http://www.unesco.org/culture/newsletter-en/sept/newsen.htm)]
- Urry, J. (1995). *Consuming Places*. Routledge: London.
- Werbner, P. (1999) 'Global pathways: working class cosmopolitans and the creation of transnational ethnic worlds', *Social Anthroppology*, 7/1 pp. 17-35